Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 6379 Filed 01/26/10 Entered 01/27/10 16:24:32 Desc Main +01/26/2010 12:05 3237269183 Document Page 1 of 14 PAGE 04

		Active to the second se	
		0010 1841 0 0 101 0 0 0	
1	Gilbert D. Sigala, Esq. (State Bar No. 109905) LAW OFFICES OF GILBERT D. SIGALA 1818 W. Beverly Blvd., Suite 206 Montebello, CA 90640	2010 JOH 26 PM 3: 25	
2		เปลูแบบประชาวไว้ที่	
3	Phone Number: (323) 726-2150 Facsimile Number: (323) 726-9183		
4			
5			
6	IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA RICHMOND DIVISION		
7			
8			
9			
10 11	In re:) Chapter 11	
12	CIRCUIT CITY STORES, INC., et al.,) Case No. 08-35653	
13	Debtors.) Jointly administered)	
14) MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE A) LATE PROOF OF CLAIM BY	
15) CLAIMANT JOHN BATIOFF	
16) Date: February 24, 2010) Time: 2:00pm (eastern)) Department: Judge Huennekens	
17	Market and the second s) Department. Judge Huelmekens	
18	To Respondent CIRCUIT CITY STORES	NC and its attorneys of record	
19	To Respondent CIRCUIT CITY STORES, INC. and its attorneys of record. 1. Claimant JOHN BATIOFF hereby moves the court to grant an order allowing him to file		
20	a late proof of claim on the grounds that he substantially complied and/or is entitled to relief on the		
21	basis of excusable neglect. This motion is based upon the points and authorities and declaration		
22	submitted by counsel in support of the relief requested.		
23	2. Claimant John Batioff filed a proof of claim with Circuit City with respect to this		
24	bankruptcy on April 2, 2009. The deadline for filing such claim was January 30, 2009, and		
25	Claimant therefore makes the following application for relief.		
26	3. Claimant John Batioff has a claim for \$275,000.00 based upon injuries sustained on		
27	December 18, 2007 in a fall at a Circuit City store in Fullerton, California. Claimant alleges that a		
28	1	of3	

Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 6379 Filed 01/26/10 Entered 01/27/10 16:24:32 Desc Main 01/26/2010 12:05 3237269183 Document Page 2 of 14 PAGE 05

dangerous condition existed in the form of a mat covering the threshold of the entrance to the store, which caused Mr. Batioff to fall and sustain personal injuries. Attached as Exhibit "1" is a demand letter to Circuit City dated June 24, 2008, referring to medical reports and billings which document severe cervical injury to Mr. Batioff requiring surgical intervention as recommended by neurosurgeon Michael Sukoff, M.D. in his report of April 9, 2008.

- 4. As further set forth in the declaration of Claimant's counsel, claimant should not be subject to the omnibus objection and should be afforded leave to file a late claim because: (1) his claim was pending and listed in a printout of claims filed before the deadline, (2) the adjusters of the claim for Circuit City never notified Claimant's counsel that deadlines for claims were imminent, (3) Claimant's counsel did not receive adequate notice of the deadline for filing a proof of claim from any other representative of Circuit City Stores, Inc., and (4) excusable neglect should allow the claim to be considered.
- 5. As previously set forth in the response by Claimant's counsel to the ninth omnibus objection, his staff had been advised by Kurtzman, Carson Consultants LLC, the west coast representatives of Circuit City, that a claim was in their system as of February 20, 2009, as confirmed by information obtained from their database, a copy of which is attached as **Exhibit** "2". As late as October 28, 2008, Specialty Risk Services, the adjusters for Circuit City, was still investigating the matter and corresponding with Claimant's counsel with no mention of an impending bankruptcy or need to give a proof of claim (a copy of the letter and reply is attached as **Exhibit** "3").

MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES

Bankruptcy rule 9006(b) provides impertinent part ... (b) Enlargement.

(1) In General.

Except as provided in paragraphs (2) and (3) of this subdivision, when an act is required or allowed to be done at or within a specified period by these rules or by a notice given there under or by order of court, the court for cause shown may at any time in its discretion (1) with or without motion or notice order the period enlarged if the request therefore is made before the expiration of the period

1 2

3

5 6

7 8 9

11

12

10

13 14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23 24

25 26

27

28

originally prescribed or as extended by a previous order or (2) on motion made after the expiration of the specified period permit the act to be done where the failure to act was the result of excusable neglect.

In this case Claimant filed a proof of claim approximately 60 days past January 30, 2009, the deadline set by the court. Only then did the counsel begin receiving notices from Circuit City, which included an omnibus objection to disallow the claim. Claimant timely filed reply papers on June 29, 2009, and has participated in the status hearings since July 15, 2009. The next status hearing is scheduled for February 24, 2010. It is believed that the bankruptcy is at a stage where no substantial prejudice would inure to Circuit City if this claim were allowed.

Case law has recognized that the bankruptcy court is permitted to grant relief in cases such as this where there has been an adequate showing of excusable neglect on the part of claimant's counsel to afford relief and allow the claim to proceed. The case of <u>Pioneer Investment v. Brunswick</u> (1993) 507 U.S. 380, 123 L.Ed.2d 74, 113 S.Ct 1489 is illustrative in demonstrating the basis for which relief can be afforded. There the attorney acknowledged receiving notice of the deadline, yet filed late due to disruptions in his former law firm which disallowed him access to his file, and the court found that excusable neglect can extend to cases where the failure to act was due to circumstances beyond control. (<u>Id.</u>, 507 U.S. at 386.)

Here, Claimant can demonstrate an adequate degree of diligence exercised in filing the claim once advised of the need to do so by representatives of Circuit City, and even if operating under the mistaken believe that a claim was in place as of February 2009. Moreover, Claimant has been diligent in responding to the Ninth Omnibus Objection raised, and has made this motion out of caution in the event relief is not afforded elsewhere.

Respectfully submitted.

Date: January 74, 2010

LAW OFFICES OF GILBERT D. SIGALA

By:

Gilbert D. Sigala, Esq.

PROOF OF SERVICE STATE OF CALIFORNIA COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

2

3

1

I, Helen Tejada, I am employed in the County of Los Angeles, State of California. I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within entitled action; my business address is 1818 W. Beverly Blvd., Suite 206, Montebello, California 90640.

5

On January 26, 2010, I served the foregoing documents described as:

6

MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE A LATE PROOF OF CLAIM BY CLAIMANT JOHN BATIOFF

7 8

on all interested parties in this action.

9 10

[] by personal service [X] by placing [] the original [X] a true copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope with postage thereon fully prepaid, in the United States post office mail box at Montebello, California, addressed as follows:

11

12

SKADDEN, SRPS, SLATE, MEAGHER & FLOM, LLP Gregg M. Galardi, Esq.

13

P. O. Box 636

14

Wilmington, Delaware 19899-0636

15

SKADDEN, SRPS, SLATE, MEAGHER & FLOM, LLP Chris L. Dickerson, Esq.

16

333 W. Wacker Drive

17

Chicago, Illinois 60606

18

Dion W. Hayes Douglas M. Foley

19

One James Center

20

901 E. Cary Street Richmond, Virginia 23219

21

22

I declare under penalty of perjury, under the laws of the State of California, that the foregoing is true and correct.

23

Executed on January 210, 2010 at Montebello, California.

24

•

25

Helen Tejada

2627

. _

28

Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 6379 Filed 01/26/10 Entered 01/27/10 16:24:32 Desc Main .01/26/2010 12:05 3237269183 Document Page 5 of 14 PAGE 08

EXHIBIT "1"

Law Offices of Gilbert D. Sigala

1818 W. Beverly Blvd., Suite 206 Montebello, CA 90640 (323) 726-2150 Fax (323) 726-9183

June 24, 2008

Lisa Griffith Specialty Risk Services P.O. Box 799 Marlton, NJ 08053

RE: Our Client(s) : John Batioff

Your Insured : Circuit City Your Claim No.: YLB46588L Date of Loss : 12/18/07

Dear Ms. Griffith:

As you know the undersigned represents the interest of John Batioff in the above referenced matter. We have now received the medical specials and are in a position to make demand for settlement of this claim without further need for litigation. To that end, enclosed please find the following medical specials

O'Connor Chiropractic, Inc.	\$1,087.50
Advanced Professional Imaging Medical Group	\$1,760.00
Michael H. Sukuoff, M.D	.\$1,200.00
	\$4,047.50

As you know it is our position that your principal is one hundred percent at fault for this accident. The facts reveal that on December 18, 2007, my client was walking into a store when his foot got caught on an improperly positioned doormant that was lying half-way over the metal threshold causing him to fall forward landing on his knee causing the injuries described below.

Due to continuing symptomatology, Mr. Batioff presented himself to O'Connor Chiropractic on December 21, 2007 complaining of neck, right arm, lower back and hip pain with weakness in both legs. He was placed on a course of physical therapy which consisted of multiple modalities and was periodically re-evaluated. He continued on this regimen until January 25, 2008.

Because of neurologic involvement, Mr. Batioff was referred to Michael Sukuff for an orthopedic neurological examination. He was examined on January 2, 2008 and an MRI was

Page Two 06/24/08

Claim No.: YLB46588L

recommended. On January 9, 2008 an MRI was conducted at Advanced Professional Imaging Medical Group which revealed the following:

- the C3-C4 disc level show a 3 to 4 mm. Posterior disc protrusion present. Disc
 dessication is present. Stenosis is noted in the anteroposterior and lateral recess
 diameter
- 2. The C4-C5 disc level shows a 3 mm. Posterior disc protrusion present. Disc dessication is present. Hypertrophic facet changes are noted anteriorly. Relative stenosis is noted in the anteroposterior and lacral recess diameter.
- 3. The C5-C6 disc level shows a 2 to 3 mm. Central disc protrusion present. Disc dessication is present. Relative lateral recess narrowing is present.
- 4. The C6-C7 disc level shows a 3 mm. Central disc protrusion present. Disc dessication is present. Spondylosis is present.

Mr Batioff returned to Dr. Sukoff for re-evaluation on April 9, 2007 with complaints of persistent neck pain and numbness of the right upper extremity radiating in a C-5-C6 fashion which is a progression of stensis and spinal compromise which was asymptomatic before the accident. Dr. Sukoff recommended surgery to correct this delicate problem in the neck.

In his supplemental report of June 14, 2008, Dr. Sukoff notes: the intensity of the disc bulges-herniations, particularly at C5-C6, are suggestive of an acute-subacute injury. The degenerative changes preexisted Mr. Batioff's fall, which not only aggravated them causing a symptoms complex but there is ample evidence that disc protrusion/herniation occurred. This is further substantiated by significant spinal cord effacement and an area of hyper-intensity at C5.

At this time our office is willing to settle this matter in the amount of \$275,000.00. Please contact me to discuss your posture towards an amicable resolution of this claim. Thank you for your anticipated prompt attention and cooperation in this matter.

Thank you for your anticipated prompt attention and cooperation in this matter.

Sincerely,

Gilbert D. Sigala

GDS:pr enclosure Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 6379 Filed 01/26/10 Entered 01/27/10 16:24:32 Desc Main $_{,01/26/2010}$ 12:05 3237269183 Document Page 8 of 14 PAGE 11

EXHIBIT "2"

Filed 01/26/10 Entered 01/27/10 16:24:32 Desc Main Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 6379 01/26/2010 12:05 3237269183 Document Page 9 of 14

Creditor Data-BATIOFF, JOHN

888-830-4650

Page 1 of 1

Creditor Data

Creditor Name: BATIOFF, JOHN Creditor Notice Name:	Date Claim Filed: KCC Claim #: Amend/Replace? No	
Debtor Name: Circuit City Stores West Coast, Inc. Case Number: 08-35654		
Claim Nature: General Unsecured Amount of Claim:	Creditor Info Altered? N	
Schedule: F Schedule Amt: \$0.00 This claim has been scheduled as Contingent, Unliquidated and Disputed.		

Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 6379 Filed 01/26/10 Entered 01/27/10 16:24:32 Desc Main .01/26/2010 12:05 3237269183 Document Page 10 of 14 PAGE 13

EXHIBIT "3"



October 28, 2008

Gilbert D Sigala, Esquire 1818 W Beverly Blvd Suite 206 Montebello CA 90640

RE:

Account:

Circuit City Stores Inc.

Claimant:

John Batioff 12/18/2007

Date of Loss: 12/

Claim Number: YLB46588L

Dear Mr. Sigala,

Specialty Risk Services is the Third Party Administrator assigned to handle the above claim on behalf of Circuit City Stores, Inc.

Please be advised I have been recently reassigned the handling of your claim. It is necessary to speak with you regarding the above incident and our investigation to date.

Please contact me Monday through Friday between the hours of 7:00 am and 3:30 pm, Eastern Standard Time.

Thank you in advance for your assistance in this matter.

Sincerely,

Rhiannon Salvati
Account Consultant

P O Box 799

Mariton, NJ 08053

Toll Free: (800) 630-0746 Ext 54479

Facsimile: (860) 392-1866

Law Offices of Gilbert D. Sigala

1818 W. Beverly Blvd., Suite 206 Montebello, CA 90640 (323) 726-2150 Fax (323) 726-9183

November 14, 2008

Specialty Risk Services P. O. Box 799 Marlton, NJ 08053

Attn: Rhiannon Salvati

RE

John Batioff

Date of Loss : Claim No. :

12/182007 YLB46588L

Account

Circuit City Stores Inc.

Dear Ms. Salvati,

This office represents Mr. Batioff in the above referred matter. I have had great difficulty in obtaining feedback on the status of the case. As you know, a demand package was forward it to you several months ago and you have had ample time to investigate this matter as well as the injuries occurred by my client.

At this time the case must go forward. I am proposing that we mediate the matter privately otherwise my client has instructed me to proceed with litigation. I would prefer to mediate this matter prior to litigation if we are in a position to settle the case. Thank you for your prompt attention to this mater.

Very truly yours,

Gilbert D. Sigala

Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 6379 Filed 01/26/10 Entered 01/27/10 16:24:32 Desc Main 01/26/2010 12:05 3237269183 Document Page 13 of 14 PAGE 03

ļ			
1 2 3 4 5	Gilbert D. Sigala, Esq. (State Bar No. 109905) LAW OFFICES OF GILBERT D. SIGALA 1818 W. Beverly Blvd., Suite 206 Montebello, CA 90640 Phone Number: (323) 726-2150 Facsimile Number: (323) 726-9183	RICHHIUND DIVISION	
6 7 8 9	IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA RICHMOND DIVISION		
10 11 12 13 14 15	In re: CIRCUIT CITY STORES, INC., et al., Debtors.	Chapter 11 Case No. 08-35653 NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION TO FILE A LATE PROOF OF CLAIM Date: February 24, 2010 Time: 2:00 p.m. Eastern Standard Time	
17 18 19 20	TO ALL DEBTORS AND THEIR ATTORNEYS OF RECORD: NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN that on February 24, 2010 at 2:00 p.m. Eastern Standard Time, or as soon thereafter as counsel may be heard by the above-entitled Court, before the Honorable Kevin Huennekens, United States Bankruptcy Judge, in the United States Bankruptcy		
22 23 24 25 26 27	Court for the Eastern District of Virginia, U.S. Courthouse, 701 East Broad Street, Room 5000, Richmond, VA 23219-1888 in the above referenced matter. Notice is hereby given that debtor John Batioff will move the court for an order granting relief to file a late proof of claim in the above entitled matter. This motion will be accompanied by the attached points and authorities, declarations and other oral evidence at the time of the hearing.		
28	1	of I	

Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 6379 Filed 01/26/10 Entered 01/27/10 16:24:32 Desc Main 01/26/2010 12:05 3237269183 Document Page 14 of 14 PAGE 02

		F-11 -	
1 2 3 4 5	Gilbert D. Sigala, Esq. (State Bar No. 109905) LAW OFFICES OF GILBERT D. SIGALA 1818 W. Beverly Blvd., Suite 206 Montebello, CA 90640 Phone Number: (323) 726-2150 Facsimile Number: (323) 726-9183	2010 JAN 25 P.Y 3: 21 RICHITUND UIVISION	
6			
7	IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT		
8	FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA RICHMOND DIVISION		
9			
10			
11	In re:) Chapter 11	
12	CIRCUIT CITY STORES, INC., et al.,) Case No. 08-35653	
13	Debtors.	REQUEST TELEPHONIC APPEARANCE	
14 15		Date: Feb. 24,2010 Time: 2:00 p.m. Eastern Standard	
16) Judge: Huennekens)	
17)	
18	Request is herby made for a telephonic appearance at the proceeding to take place on		
19	February 24, 2010 at 2:00 p.m. Eastern Standard Time before the Honorable Kevin Huennekens,		
20	United States Bankruptcy Judge, in the United States Bankruptcy Court for the Eastern		
21	District of Virginia, U.S. Courthouse, 701 East Broad Street, Room 5000, Richmond, VA 23219-		
22	1888 in the above referenced matter. This request is necessary because counsel is out of state and		
23	cannot personally appear.	-	
24	OR	EDER	
25	Good cause being shown creditor's couns	el is hereby allowed to appear by telephone.	
26	Date: January, 2010		
27		UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY JUDGE	
28	1	of 1	